COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY FROM THE CLASSROOM TO CAMPUS POLITICS THE NORMALIZATION OF ANTISEMITISM, ANTI-DEMOCRATIC POLITICS, MARGINALIZATION AND INTIMIDATION



2024



The Institute for the Study of Global Antisemitism and Policy (ISGAP) is committed to fighting antisemitism on the battlefield of ideas.

ISGAP is dedicated to scholarly research into the origins, processes, and manifestations of global antisemitism and of other forms of prejudice, including various forms of racism, as they relate to policy in an age of globalization.

On the basis of this examination of antisemitism and policy, ISGAP disseminates analytical and scholarly materials to help combat hatred and promote understanding.

For further information contact:

The Institute for the Study of Global Antisemitism and Policy

Email: info@isgap.org Website: www.isgap.org

© ISGAP 2024 – All rights reserved ISBN number – 978-1-940186-94-8

Contents		Page
•	Glossary	1
•	Background	2
•	Executive Summary	3
•	Support for Extremism, Terrorism,	5
	and Antisemitism at Columbia	
•	Columbia University Students for Justice in Palestine (SJP)	11
•	The Middle East Institute (MEI) at Columbia University	18
•	Analysis of Qatari Funding to Columbia University	26
•	Policy Recommendations	34

Glossary

BDS Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions movement

CSMS Center for the Study of Muslim Societies

CPS Center for Palestine Studies

CUAD Columbia University Apartheid Divest

DOE Department of Education

DOJ Department of Justice

EAA Education Above All

EAC Educate A Child

GPC Gas Processing Center, Qatar University

JVP Jewish Voice for Peace

MB Muslim Brotherhood

MEI Middle East Institute (Columbia University)

NPRP The National Priorities Research Program

QF Qatar Foundation for Education, Science and Community

Development

QFI Qatar Foundation International LLC

QNRF Qatar National Research Fund

NSJP National Students for Justice in Palestine

WISE World Innovation Summit for Education

Background

In July 2019, at the Department of Justice (DOJ) in Washington, D.C., Dr. Charles Asher Small, Executive Director of the Institute for the Study of Global Antisemitism and Policy (ISGAP), presented the findings of an ISGAP research project started in 2012, entitled "Follow the Money." This ongoing research project examines illicit funding of US universities by foreign governments, foundations, and corporations that adhere to and promote anti-democratic and antisemitic ideologies, with connections to terrorism and terror financing.¹

The project revealed, for the first time, the existence of substantial Middle Eastern funding to U.S. universities (primarily from Qatar) that had not been reported to the Department of Education (DOE), as required by law. In fact, ISGAP's research uncovered billions of dollars of unreported funds, which in turn led to the launch of a federal government investigation in 2019.

As part of its continued research, ISGAP has uncovered and established that the foreign donations from Qatar, in particular, have contributed substantially to rising levels of antisemitic discourse and campus politics at U.S. universities, as well as growing support for anti-democratic values within these institutions of higher education. Qatar has spent billions of dollars, and a large proportion of this has gone unreported to the DOE. With the explosion of antisemitism at North American universities in recent months, there are also security concerns that have potential domestic and global implications.

For decades, Qatar has strategically positioned itself as an international funder of education, finance, science, health, sports, arts and culture, communications, and development, despite only being a small country with less than 350,000 citizens. As part of this positioning, Qatar is currently the largest foreign donor to U.S. universities.² Despite its close ties to the United States and other Western countries, Qatar has also built an extensive network of Islamist partners dedicated to expanding its influence.³ It hosts, supports, and represents the Muslim Brotherhood (MB); maintains ties with Iran; hosts the Taliban; supports and maintains an office for Hamas and its exiled leadership; and has backed militias in Syria and Libya.⁴

¹ "VOLUME II Examining Undocumented Foreign Funding of American Universities: Implications for Education and Rising Antisemitism," *ISGAP* (2020), https://isgap.org/post/2020/09/volume-ii-examining-undocumentedforeign-funding-of-american-universities-implications-for-education-and-rising-antisemitism/

² Sophie Shulman, "Tuition of terror: Qatari money flowed into U.S. universities—and now it's fueling violence," *CTech*, October 30, 2023, https://www.calcalistech.com/ctechnews/article/jwhsqhrat

³ We refer here to the political ideology of Islamism and not the religion of Islam as practiced peacefully by Muslims worldwide.

⁴ David B. Roberts, "Reflecting on Qatar's 'Islamist' Soft Power," *Policy Brief* (2019): 1, https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/FP_20190408_qatar_roberts.pdf

Executive Summary

Columbia University is the oldest institution of higher education in New York, and the fifth oldest in the United States. Today, it is one of the world's leading research institutions. Joint degree programs are available through Union Theological Seminary, the Jewish Theological Seminary of America and the Juilliard School, whilst Teachers College and Barnard College are official faculties of the university. Columbia University has additionally been at the forefront of an explosion of antisemitism on North American campuses since Hamas's October 7 terrorist attack on Israel in which some 1,200 people were murdered and over 240 people were taken hostage.

Students and faculty at Columbia University have openly praised the terrorist attack by Hamas and have contributed to an environment at Columbia University in which Jewish students and staff do not feel safe. Two lawsuits have been filed against Columbia University and a Congressional hearing has been held concerning its failure to protect its Jewish constituents amid rising campus antisemitism.

Despite receiving large amounts of funding from Qatar over the years, Columbia University has not reported any of this funding to the Department of Education (DOE). Moreover, there have been no references to connections between Columbia University and Qatar or Qatari entities in its financial statements.

The relationship between Qatar and Columbia University is characterized by varying degrees of collaboration that have endured over an extended period of time. They include:

a. Collaboration with Qatar Foundation International

There are two joint projects between Columbia University and Qatar Foundation International (QFI).

Estimated Qatari funding: \$500,000.

b. National Priorities Research Program (NPRP) Grants

Within the Qatar National Research Fund (QNRF), there are six NPRP projects that involve collaboration with Columbia University. ISGAP estimates the Qatari contribution to Columbia University to be approximately \$250,000 for each project.

Estimated Qatari estimated funding: \$1,500,000.

c. Qatar and Columbia University Energy Partnerships

⁵ "Looking Out on a City and a World," *Columbia University in the City of New York*, https://www.columbia.edu/content/university-history

⁶ Please refer to 'Analysis of Qatari Funding to Columbia University' chapter.

ISGAP has found seven research projects involving collaboration between the Gas Processing Center (GPC) at Qatar University and Columbia University's Department of Chemistry.

Estimated Qatari funding: \$1,750,000.

d. Qatar & Columbia University Education Partnerships

In April 2014, the Qatar Foundation (QF) hosted a delegation from Columbia University in Education City, Qatar. In addition, on September 20, 2019, the Qatar Foundation's World Innovation Summit for Education (WISE) held an international conference, alongside UNESCO and Teachers College, Columbia University, that was attended by six Columbia staff.

It is difficult to estimate the Qatari funding budget to Columbia University faculty for these activities.

e. Student Grants

The Amiri Scholarship Program, which is fully funded by the State of Qatar, is designed to sponsor university students for full-time undergraduate and graduate studies abroad at leading international universities. ISGAP has uncovered that 14 Qataris have obtained degrees from Columbia University between 2006 and 2023. Collectively, these individuals have amassed a total of 38 years of study at the university.

Estimated Qatari funding: \$3,420,000.

As noted above, none of this foreign funding has been reported to the DOE, in violation of existing regulations.

This report starts by examining the explosion of antisemitism on Columbia University's campus since October 7, 2023. This is followed by an exploration of the role of Columbia's chapter of Students for Justice in Palestine (SJP) in fostering a hostile environment at the university. Next, a brief investigation of the Middle East Institute at Columbia is presented, followed by an analysis of the financial relationship between Qatar and Columbia University. The report concludes with a number of policy recommendations.

 ^{7 &}quot;Columbia University team gains insight into Education City," *Gulf Times*, April 21, 2014,
 https://www.gulf-times.com/story/389270/columbia-university-team-gains-insight-into-education-city
 8 "The Future of AI in Education," *WISE*, Qatar Foundation, https://www.wise-qatar.org/future-artificial-intelligence-education-teachers-college-columbia-university/

<u>Support for Extremism, Terrorism, and Antisemitism at</u> Columbia

Columbia University has gained a reputation for being at the forefront of an intellectual discourse that demonizes Israel and the Jewish people. University faculty, including Edward Said, Rashid Khalidi, and Joseph Massad, have spearheaded this discourse, which initially pervaded the area of the Middle East studies and is increasingly spreading into the social sciences and the humanities. It can be argued that it is this discourse that has informed much of the antisemitic rhetoric at the widely criticized National Students for Justice in Palestine (NSJP)–led university encampments, which began in April 2024.

Following Hamas's pogrom on October 7, over 100 Columbia faculty members signed a letter supporting student groups such as Students for Justice in Palestine (SJP), which declared itself part of the Hamas-led resistance movement⁹ and defended (or, as the statement put it, "recontextualize") Hamas's attack as "just one salvo in an ongoing war between an occupying state and the people it occupies, or as an occupied people exercising a right to resist." ¹⁰ In the letter, which called the Hamas terrorism on October 7th "military action" Columbia faculty defended students "who have shown support for Hamas." ¹¹ Columbia Professor Joseph Massad stated that Hamas's October 7 pogrom was "awesome" and "astounding." ¹² Massad has previously been quoted as arguing that "the Jewish state is a racist state that does not have a right to exist" and that Israel represents "the transformation of the Jew into the anti-Semite, and the Palestinian into the Jew." ¹³

Rashid Khalidi, the Edward Said Professor of Modern Arab Studies at Columbia University, similarly describes Israel as a "settler-colonial process" that is "illegitimate." Khalidi has been extensively linked to the Palestinian Liberation Organization (PLO) at a time when the organization was designated as a foreign

^{9 &}quot;Day of Resistance Toolkit," https://isgap.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/10/DAY-OF-RESISTANCETOOLKIT.pdf

^{10 &}quot;Columbia University," ADL, https://www.adl.org/campus-antisemitism-report-card/columbia-university

¹¹ Mike LaChance, "Columbia U. Profs Sign Letter Calling Hamas Attack a 'Military Action,' Defending Students Who Supported it," *Legal Insurrection*, October 31, 2023, https://legalinsurrection.com/2023/10/columbia-u-profs-sign-letter-calling-hamas-attack-a-military-action-defending-students-who-supported-it/

¹² "Columbia hires, and claims to fire, professor who voiced support for Hamas post-Oct. 7," *The Times of Israel*, May 2, 2024, https://www.timesofisrael.com/columbia-hires-and-claims-to-fire-professor-who-voiced-support-for-hamas-post-oct-7/

¹³ Charles Jacobs Ralph A. Goldwasser, "Columbia Unbecoming—Then and Now," *The Forward*, December 27, 2016, https://forward.com/community/358502/columbia-unbecoming-then-and-now/

¹⁴ Harry Lambert, "Rashid Khalidi: "Israel is stealing land as we speak,"" *New Statesman*, November 14, 2023, https://www.newstatesman.com/international-content/the-international-interview/2023/11/rashid-khalidi-israel-palestine-war

terrorist organization by the State Department (in 1987). ¹⁵ He has been described as spokesperson and "a director of the Palestinian press agency" for the PLO. ¹⁶

Previously, during the 2006–2007 academic year, Columbia University's World Leaders Forum controversially hosted an address by President Mahmoud Ahmadinejad of the Islamic Republic of Iran. On this occasion, Ahmadinejad was banned from visiting Ground Zero by the New York Police Department (NYPD), but was nevertheless invited to Columbia. Ahmadinejad has a history of denying the Holocaust. During his time as president, he repeatedly called for the eradication of Israel and also suppressed human and civil liberties in Iran. 18

On April 17, 2024, the House Committee on Education and the Workforce held a Congressional hearing to investigate Columbia University's "failure to ... protect Jewish students" amid an explosion of on-campus antisemitism after October 7, 2023. Jewish students and staff at Columbia have voiced concerns about the increasingly hostile and antisemitic environment at the university since October 7. To demonstrate, on October 30, 2023, Jewish students recalled their experiences of antisemitism on campus in front of reporters, detailing that "students have been spat on for speaking Hebrew" and "swastikas [had been] drawn on school property." 20

In February 2024, a lawsuit was filed against Columbia University and Barnard College on behalf of five Jewish students and two organizations under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, alleging "particularly severe and pervasive" antisemitism on campus. The lawsuit drew attention to Columbia professors Rashid Khalidi, Hamid Dabashi, Joseph Massad, and Katherine Franke, who have "been repeatedly exposed for their expression of antisemitic views, endorsement of violence against Jews, and/or calls for Israel's destruction." ²²

 ¹⁵ Cinnamon Stillwell, "Rashid Khalidi, Campus Watch & Middle East Studies," Jewish Policy Center (2008), https://www.jewishpolicycenter.org/2008/11/30/rashid-khalidi-campus-watch-middle-east-studies/
 ¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ "President Mahmoud Ahmadinejad of the Islamic Republic of Iran," *Columbia University World Leaders Forum*, 2006–2007, https://worldleaders.columbia.edu/content/president-mahmoud-ahmadinejad-islamic-republic-iran
¹⁸ "Iranian President to Speak at Columbia U.," *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, September 20, 2007, https://www.chronicle.com/article/iranian-president-to-speak-at-columbia-u/

¹⁹ "Columbia University President and Board Chairs to Testify at Antisemitism Hearing," *Committee on Education & the Workforce*, March 11, 2024,

https://edworkforce.house.gov/news/documentsingle.aspx?DocumentID=410265

²⁰ Nia Clark, "Jewish students at Columbia University decry antisemitism," *Spectrum News 1*, October 30, 2023, https://nyl.com/nyc/manhattan/education/2023/10/31/jewish-students-at-columbia-university-decry-antisemitism

²¹ Rebecca Massel, "Columbia, Barnard hit with lawsuit alleging 'particularly severe and pervasive' antisemitism," *Columbia Spectator*, February 22, 2024,

 $[\]frac{https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2024/02/21/columbia-barnard-hit-with-lawsuit-alleging-particularly-severe-and-pervasive-antisemitism/$

²² Ibid.

In March 2024, a group called Columbia University Apartheid Divest (CUAD) extended an invitation to Khaled Barakat and his wife Charlotte Kates, international coordinator of Samidoun, the Palestinian Prisoner Solidarity Network, which is connected to the Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (PFLP).²³ The PFLP is terrorist group closely aligned with Hamas and Hezbollah that combines Arab nationalism with a Marxist-Leninist ideology and views the destruction of Israel as integral to the struggle to remove Western capitalism from the Middle East.²⁴ Kates and Barakat spoke at a seminar called "Resistance 101," where Kates told attendees that "there is nothing wrong with being a fighter in Hamas."²⁵ Several students who organized the event were later suspended for their involvement.²⁶

On April 29, 2024, a class action lawsuit was filed against Columbia University,. It accused the university of allowing its Jewish students to be "pushed off campus by open threats and harassment from extremists within the protest movement." In the lawsuit, it was reported that in recent weeks there had been "round-the-clock harassment of Jewish students, who [had] been punched, shoved, spat upon, blocked from attending classes and moving freely about campus, and targeted by pro-terrorist hate speech—both verbal and in written form on massive banners and signs—with statements such as: "Death to the Jews"; "Long live Hamas"; "Globalize the Intifada." Congressman Jared Moskowitz noted that the discourse has largely shifted from a call for "ceasefire now" to one of "bomb Tel Aviv," alongside other pro-Hamas statements.²⁹

Previously, in June 2015, over 50 Columbia professors and staff signed a petition calling on "the University to divest its stocks, funds, and endowment from companies that profit from the State of Israel's ongoing system of settler colonialism, military occupation, and apartheid law."

²³ Isabel Vincent and Dana Kennedy, "Pro-terror radical launched 2-hour anti-Israel tirade at Columbia University event weeks before protests exploded: 'Nothing wrong with being a Hamas fighter'," *New York Post*, April 24, 2024, https://nypost.com/2024/04/24/us-news/palestinian-radical-at-columbia-nothing-wrong-with-hamas/

²⁴ "Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine," Counter Terrorism Guide, November 2022, https://www.dni.gov/nctc/ftos/pflp_fto.html

²⁵ Isabel Vincent and Dana Kennedy, "Pro-terror radical launched 2-hour anti-Israel tirade at Columbia University event weeks before protests exploded: 'Nothing wrong with being a Hamas fighter'," *New York Post*, April 24, 2024, https://nypost.com/2024/04/24/us-news/palestinian-radical-at-columbia-nothing-wrong-with-hamas/

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Tiah Shepherd, "Jewish student sues Columbia for failing to provide a safe environment amid campus protests," *The Hill*, April 29, 2024, https://thehill.com/homenews/4631059-jewish-student-sues-columbia-for-failing-to-provide-a-safe-environment-amid-campus-protests/

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Congressman Jared Moskowitz, "Moskowitz on CNN Recounts Columbia University Visit amid Antisemitic Protests," CNN, *YouTube*, April 23, 2024, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Ys_2Z_vftJA

³⁰ "Columbia University Apartheid Divest," Way Back Machine,

https://web.archive.org/web/20160304061749/http://apartheid-divest.rhcloud.com/statement.html

On March 11, 2024, Katherine Franke, the James L. Dohr Professor of Law at Columbia Law School and a member of the faculty of Columbia Law School since 1999, affirmed to Supreme Court of the State of New York that "I have been involved in supporting and advising the petitioner students and student groups ... over the past few months regarding their Pro-Palestine activism and their experiences with the Columbia and Barnard administration(s)."³¹ As documented by the detailed research done by *Documenting Jew Hatred on Campus*, Franke repeatedly called for the exclusion of students who served in the Israeli Defense Force (IDF) from campus. Thus, calling for the exclusion of almost all Israeli citizens, due to the mandatory nature of military service in Israel.

In November 2019, a teacher at Ethical Culture Fieldston School (ECFS) was fired for inviting Columbia professor Kayum Ahmed as a guest speaker for an audience of around 500 high-school students, after a video showed Ahmed responding to a student stating that,

"The [Nazi] attacks are a shameful part of history, but in some ways, it reflects the fluidity between those who are victims becoming perpetrators ... I use the same example in talking about the Holocaust. That Jews who suffered in the Holocaust and established the State of Israel today—they perpetrate violence against Palestinians that [is] unthinkable."

Two Democratic Congressmen, Josh Gottheimer and Max Rose, followed up on Ahmed's comments, stating, "We would like to understand how such a speaker could be invited to address ECFS students, what steps the school has taken to hold those responsible accountable, how the school has communicated to students and parents that such rhetoric is unacceptable.³⁵

According to *The Wall Street Journal*, as part of a semester long introduction to public health, Ahmed teaches a mandatory class for around 420 first-year graduate students, in which Israel was labeled as a settler-colonial state.³⁶ Graduate students

³¹ "Affirmation of Katherine Franke," New York County Clerk,

https://www.nyclu.org/sites/default/files/field_documents/nyscef_017_affirmation_of_katherine_franke_2024-03-11.pdf

³² "Public DJHC Archive Document," *Documenting Jew Hatred on Campus*, V19, April 26, 2024, https://docs.google.com/document/d/li_gIbWQ7ZmpchHze7vKV52MfBCG0eHxLXGUgC1A34yQ/edit#heading=h.cwzg41tz6g70

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Morgan Phillips, "Elite New York school is rocked by anti-Semitism claims after swastikas daubed on walls," *Fox News*, December 19, 2019, https://www.foxnews.com/us/new-york-city-school-anti-semitism-claims-swastikas

³⁵ Kirstyn Brendlen, "Teacher's criticism of Israel leads to dismissal," *The Riverdale Press*, January 19, 2020, https://www.riverdalepress.com/stories/teachers-criticism-of-israel-leads-to-dismissal,70993

³⁶ Douglas Belkin, "Some Columbia Professors Accused of Pro-Palestinian Indoctrination," *The Wall Street Journal*, March 8, 2024, https://www.wsj.com/us-news/education/some-columbia-professors-accused-of-propalestinian-indoctrination-002013fc

who have taken his class have accused Ahmed of radicalizing students and pro-Palestinian "political indoctrination."³⁷

Ahmed has worked closely with scholars who have been accused of antisemitic discourse. For example, Bram Wilselwey, was accused of teaching a course which "contained disturbing antisemitic topics and materials, including required readings propagating antisemitic claims and Hamas propaganda, by denying Jewish ethnic identity … downplaying antisemitism and the Holocaust."³⁸

Ahmed spoke at a BDS SA/Open Shuhada Street Holocaust Remembrance Day ceremony with other notable anti-Israel activists in January 2013.³⁹ He noted during the ceremony that, "while the holocaust was an immense tragedy, we can't allow the survivors to emotionally blackmail us into silence about their crimes."⁴⁰

Ahmed was also among over 100 Columbia University and Barnard College faculty who signed an open letter claiming that the October 7 massacre,

"represented a military response by a people who had endured crushing and unrelenting state violence from an occupying power over many years. One could regard the events of October 7th as just one salvo in an ongoing war between an occupying state and the people it occupies, or as an occupied people exercising a right to resist violent and illegal occupation."

On October 17, 2023, Ahmed organized a panel discussion where the invited speakers made remarks including it is "impossible to work with the zionists because they advocate for supremacy." On November 29, 2023, Ahmed co-authored an open letter to the *Health and Human Rights Journal* seeking to pressure the United States to cease its support for Israel. The authors of the letter accuse Israel of war crimes and apartheid and commit to teaching students "about the settler-colonial determinants of health."

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ "Harvard Complaint," *Kasowitz Benson Torres LLP*, https://www.kasowitz.com/media/unxcnvpo/harvard-complaint.pdf; A. Kayum Ahmed, Bram Wispelwey, and Yara Asi, "Health Faculty Call for Ceasefire in Gaza and Centering Palestine in the Classroom," *Health and Human Rights Journal*, November 29, 2023, https://www.hhrjournal.org/2023/11/health-faculty-call-for-ceasefire-in-gaza-and-centering-palestine-in-the-classroom/

³⁹ "On Anti-Semitism," BDS South Africa, https://www.bdssouthafrica.com/about/on-anti-semitism/

⁴⁰ David Lange, "BDSHoles Commemorate Holocaust Remembrance Day Their Way," *IsraellyCool*, January 31, 2013, https://www.israellycool.com/2013/01/31/bdsholes-commemorate-holocaust-remembrance-day-their-way/
⁴¹ "Columbia Faculty Letter: Grave Concerns About the Well-Being of Our Students," October 30, 2023,

⁴¹ "Columbia Faculty Letter: Grave Concerns About the Well-Being of Our Students," October 30, 20 https://docs.google.com/document/u/1/d/e/2PACX-

 $[\]underline{1vSxEIf0j1H6v3R4549yxfetSBy1ioc6VHyJa3vKfvgyVFX9TAluk_1laTuSBKAyzqjF3hJT9EVw0P7a/pub}$

⁴² "Public DJHC Archive Document," *Documenting Jew Hatred on Campus*, V19, April 26, 2024, https://docs.google.com/document/d/1i_gIbWQ7ZmpchHze7vKV52MfBCG0eHxLXGUgC1A34yQ/edit#heading=h.cwzg41tz6g70

⁴³ A. Kayum Ahmed, Bram Wispelwey, and Yara Asi, "Health Faculty Call for Ceasefire in Gaza and Centering Palestine in the Classroom," *Health and Human Rights Journal*, November 29, 2023,

Finally, Ahmed signed a petition calling on Columbia to reverse the suspension of the campus chapters of SJP and JVP in November 2023. The signatories accuse Columbia of "punishing students for protesting against ethnic cleansing and genocide.⁴⁴

It is important to note that Columbia University has established a task force to combat antisemitism in the wake of October 7. Its first report called for limits on protests and a better enforcement of existing rules. ⁴⁵ However, the 15-member group has received criticism for its failure to settle on a definition of antisemitism. ⁴⁶

https://www.hhrjournal.org/2023/11/health-faculty-call-for-ceasefire-in-gaza-and-centering-palestine-in-the-classroom/

^{44 &}quot;SIPA Statement," Columbia Alumni 4 Palestine, November 13, 2023, https://cu-alumni4palestine.com

⁴⁵ Sharon Otterman, "What Is Antisemitism? A Columbia Task Force Would Rather Not Say," *The New York Times*, March 21, 2024, https://www.nytimes.com/2024/03/21/nyregion/columbia-antisemitism-israel-gaza-protests.html

⁴⁶ Ibid.

Columbia University Students for Justice in Palestine (SJP)

Columbia University has nearly 350 registered student groups, five of which have declared themselves in favor of the Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions (BDS) movement.⁴⁷ The BDS movement is aggressively anti-Zionist, and, through challenging international support for Israel, largely denies the legitimacy of Israel's very existence. The BDS Movement define Israel as "settler colonialism, apartheid and occupation."48

1. Students for Justice in Palestine (SJP)

SJP was first recognized by Columbia University in 2009, and states on its website that, "We are a Columbia student group organizing for justice and human rights for Palestinians. We work to raise awareness about issues relating to Palestine and we support the Palestinian Civil Society call for Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions (BDS) of Israel."49 SJP and JVP are financed by American Muslims for Palestine (AMP).⁵⁰ There exists substantial evidence linking AMP—in particular its staff and founders—to terrorist groups including Hamas and Palestinian Islamic Jihad.⁵¹ Indeed, the founders of AMP were formerly members of the Holy Land Foundation, which was forced to close because it provided material support to Hamas. AMP has organized SJP conferences, arranging venues, speakers, and logistics.⁵² In the "SJP Toolkit" released shortly after the October 7 terrorist attacks, the organization openly declares itself to be part of the "movement" and not just supporters.⁵³ Columbia University SJP stated that it was "in full solidarity" with Hamas's "resistance." ⁵⁴ Hamas is an Islamist militant group that spun off from the Palestinian branch of the Muslim Brotherhood in the late 1980s.55 The political, cultural, and social establishment of Qatar has been profoundly influenced by Muslim Brotherhood activists, and the

https://undergrad.admissions.columbia.edu/life/here/clubs/listings

https://lionlink.columbia.edu/organizations?branches=65172&query=pales

https://docs.house.gov/meetings/FA/FA18/20160419/104817/HHRG-114-FA18-Wstate-Schanzer [20160419.pdf?ref=stanfordreview.org

⁴⁷ "Student Groups," Columbia Undergraduate Admissions,

^{48 &}quot;What is BDS?," BDS Movement, https://bdsmovement.net/what-is-bds

^{49 &}quot;Organizations," Columbia LionLink,

⁵⁰ "National Students for Justice in Palestine (NSJP)," ISGAP (2024), https://isgap.org/wpcontent/uploads/2024/05/SIP_Report.pdf

⁵¹ Jonathan Schanzer, "Congressional Testimony at Hearing before House Homeland Security Committee Counterterrorism and Intelligence Subcommittee," May 12, 2016,

^{52 &}quot;AMP Seeks to Coordinate Student anti-Israel Activity," ADL, December 21, 2010, https://www.adl.org/resources/news/amp-seeks-coordinate-student-anti-israel-activity

^{53 &}quot;Day of Resistance Toolkit," https://isgap.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/10/DAY-OF-RESISTANCETOOLKIT.pdf
54 @sjp.columbia, Instagram, October 9, 2023, https://www.instagram.com/sjp.columbia/?hl=en

⁵⁵ Kali Robinson, "What is Hamas?," Council on Foreign Relations, April 18, 2024, https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/what-hamas

country has provided a safe haven for Hamas's political leadership since 2012.

2. The Palestinian Student Union at Columbia University

According to Columbia University's website, the Palestinian Student Union "serves as a platform for Palestinian groups, students, and allies across the university to come together, collaborate, and advocate for the Palestinian cause."56

3. Columbia-Barnard Jewish Voice for Peace (JVP)

JVP maintains a horizontal structure among its members. Over the years, it has often coordinated with SJP because of their shared goals. For example, the groups have organized joint demonstrations and vigils and have jointly advocated for the BDS movement.⁵⁷ It has now been admitted by an attorney for AMP that the group has been funding JVP.⁵⁸

4. Columbia-Barnard Young Democratic Socialists of America (YDSA)

According to Columbia University's website, "YDSA is the campus section of the largest socialist organization in the U.S. Our aim is to build collective power among students & workers, create spaces for political education, and contribute to broader struggles against capitalism & oppression."59

5. J Street U Columbia/Barnard

According to Columbia University's website, J Street is "Pro-Israel, Pro-Peace, Pro-Democracy, Pro two States, Pro-Justice, Pro Palestinian."60

The most vocal group advocating for BDS is SJP, which often works together with JVP. To demonstrate, on September 29, 2020, a referendum at Columbia calling for divestment from companies "that profit off Israeli apartheid and human rights abuses against Palestinians" passed with a sizable margin. 61 The Columbia University Apartheid Divest (CUAD) campaign began in 2016, as a coalition of students from Columbia SJP and Columbia/Barnard JVP.62

https://lionlink.columbia.edu/organizations?branches=65172&query=pales

https://lionlink.columbia.edu/organizations?branches=65172&guery=pales

⁵⁶ "Organizations," Columbia LionLink,

^{57 &}quot;Affirmation of Cameron Jones," New York County Clerk, https://www.nyclu.org/sites/default/files/field_documents/nyscef_009_affirmation_of_cameron_jones_2024-03-11.pdf

⁵⁸ Josh Boswell, "Pro-Palestine campus group behind Columbia University protests received over \$3 million a year in funding from 'charities' linked to Hamas," Daily Mail, May 1, 2024,

https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-13363943/Pro-Palestine-group-Columbia-University-protestsfundinglinked-Hamas.html

⁵⁹ "Organizations," Columbia LionLink,

^{60 &}quot;Organizations," Columbia LionLink,

https://lionlink.columbia.edu/organizations?branches=65172&guery=pales

⁶¹ "Columbia College Passes Historic Vote on Divestment from Israel," The Morningside Post, October 5, 2020, https://morningsidepost.com/articles/2020/10/5/columbia-college-passes-historic-vote-on-divestment-fromisrael

⁶² Ibid.

Columbia SJP and JVP have additionally allied with the group Within Our Lifetime (WOL) to express support for Houthi attacks on Red Sea shipping. ⁶³ Until 2019, WOL was known as the New York City branch of SJP, going by NYC SJP. ⁶⁴ WOL has officially endorsed the October 7 terror attack on Israel and has vocally supported Hamas at rallies. ⁶⁵ The co-founder and chair of WOL is Nerdeen Kiswani, who refused to condemn the "resistance" of Hamas after October 7 and has propagated classic antisemitic tropes, such as the alleged "Zionist" control over media and politics. ⁶⁶ The fiscal sponsor of National Students for Justice in Palestine (NSJP, the umbrella organization of local SJP chapters) and WOL is Westchester Peace Action Committee (WESPAC), a 501(c)(3) registered non-profit organization. ⁶⁷ Through WESPAC, organizations including NSJP and WOL are able to receive tax-deductible donations without disclosing their funding sources or the extent of support given.

Columbia University suspended its chapters of SJP and JVP in November 2023 for failing to show "a commitment to compliance with university policies." As of April 2024, the two groups remain suspended. Columbia University Apartheid Divest (CUAD), a non-university-recognized coalition formed following the suspensions of SJP and JVP, threatened a tuition strike if its demands for the university to divest from companies connected to Israel were not met. 69 In addition, Palestine Legal—the legal pillar of the BDS and pro-Palestinian movements in North America—sued Columbia University on behalf of SJP, JVP, and the students who lead these groups,

⁶³ "Hundreds call for intifada, hail Houthis at Columbia University anti-Israel protest," *The Times of Israel*, January 19, 2024, https://www.timesofisrael.com/liveblog_entry/hundreds-call-for-intifada-hail-houthis-at-columbia-university-anti-israel-protest/

⁶⁴ "National Students for Justice in Palestine," *ISGAP*, https://isgap.org/wpcontent/uploads/2024/05/SJP_Report.pdf

⁶⁵ Isabel Vincent and Dana Kennedy, "Pro-terror radical launched 2-hour anti-Israel tirade at Columbia University event weeks before protests exploded: 'Nothing wrong with being a Hamas fighter'," *New York Post*, April 24, 2024, https://nypost.com/2024/04/24/us-news/palestinian-radical-at-columbia-nothing-wrong-with-hamas/

^{66 &}quot;National Students for Justice in Palestine," *ISGAP*, https://isgap.org/wpcontent/uploads/2024/05/SJP_Report.pdf

⁶⁷ "Donations to major pro-Palestinian groups go through this Jewish-chaired NY nonprofit," *The Times of Israel*, February 2, 2024, https://www.timesofisrael.com/donations-to-major-pro-palestinian-groups-go-through-this-jewish-chaired-ny-nonprofit/; "National Students for Justice in Palestine," *ISGAP*, https://isgap.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/05/SIP_Report.pdf

⁶⁸ Luke Tress, "Columbia University chapters of SJP, JVP remain suspended as new semester begins," *The Times of Israel*, January 20, 2024, https://www.timesofisrael.com/columbia-university-chapters-of-sjp-jvp-remain-suspended-as-new-semester-begins/

⁶⁹ Daksha Pillai, Shea Vance, Joseph Zuloaga, "Pro-Palestinian student groups hold 'divestment now' rally on Low Steps, call for tuition strike," *Columbia Spectator*, January 19, 2024,

 $[\]frac{https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2024/01/19/pro-palestinian-student-groups-hold-divestment-now-rally-on-low-steps-call-for-tuition-$

strike/?fbclid=IwAR2E054pDp_xPARZfsx_ZKtntPgjlEa0scbWnXsrEfsoJo3o6dOzKmxY8TE&utm_source=bulkemail&utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=all-emails

including Maryam Alwan and Cameron Jones.⁷⁰ Following the suspensions, Columbia University faculty organized a rally in support of JVP and SJP.⁷¹

To address campus hostilities, on January 19, 2024, Barnard College, Columbia University, organized "A Day of Dialogue and Reflection." Notably, one of the speakers offered for the event by Barnard was Professor Hatem Bazian, a founder of SJP (more information can be found on the antisemitic, violent and pro-terror affiliations of Bazian in ISGAP's report, "National Students for Justice in Palestine (NSJP)"). Columbia defended its decision to invite Bazian to speak at the event, praising him as a "renowned" scholar who could help students "examine all viewpoints." The college cancelled classes so that students could attend this event, and even offered attendees a chance to win a campus store gift card if they registered to the event early. To

Further involvement of faculty in the activities of student organizations can be evidenced by Columbia professor Joseph Howley, who has reportedly indicated to be the representative of the Columbia, Barnard, and Teacher's College chapter of Faculty for Justice in Palestine (FJP-CBT). At a 'march' whereby protestors chanted calls to violence, such as "Globalize the Intifada," "Resistance is justified when people are occupied," and "Palestine, free, free. Zionists go out," Howley spoke "as a Jew" in support of the calls. 77

What is more, FJP promoted and supported an event titled "Resistance 101" on March 24, 2024, organized by Columbia University Apartheid Divest (CUAD) with Samidoun Palestinian Prisoner Network. Samidoun has known ties to the Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (PFLP) and has been banned, alongside Hamas, in Germany. The event also featured speakers from Masar Badil, the Palestinian Alternative Revolutionary Path Movement, a group which has praised the October 7

⁷⁰ Sarah Huddleston, "NYCLU, Palestine Legal sue Columbia over 'unlawful suspension' of SJP and JVP," *Columbia Spectator*, March 12, 2024,

https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2024/03/12/nyclu-palestine-legal-sue-columbia-over-unlawful-suspension-of-sip-and-ivp/

⁷¹ "Public DJHC Archive Document," *Documenting Jew Hatred on Campus*, V19, April 26, 2024, https://docs.google.com/document/d/li_gIbWQ7ZmpchHze7vKV52MfBCG0eHxLXGUgC1A34yQ/edit#heading=h.cwzg41tz6g70

⁷² Ibid.

⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁴ Alana Goodman, "Columbia Defends Inclusion of Anti-Semitic Terror Defender in University's 'Day of Dialogue' [incl. Hatem Bazian]," Campus Watch, January 23, 2024, https://www.meforum.org/campus-watch/65485/columbia-defends-inclusion-of-anti-semitic-terror

⁷⁵ Ibid.

⁷⁶ "Public DJHC Archive Document," *Documenting Jew Hatred on Campus*, V19, April 26, 2024, https://docs.google.com/document/d/li_gIbWQ7ZmpchHze7vKV52MfBCG0eHxLXGUgC1A34yQ/edit#heading=h.cwzg41tz6g70;; More information can be found on Faculty for Justice in Palestine in ISGAP's report "National Students for Justice in Palestine (NSJP)."

⁷⁷ Ibid.

⁷⁸ Ibid.

terrorist attack by Hamas, labelling it as "heroic Palestinian resistance." Barnard Center for Research on Women (BCRW) – a further faculty organization – reportedly provided "logistical support by agreeing to host the event."

On March 11, 2024, Alwan affirmed to the Supreme Court of the State of New York that,

"SJP is ... part of the Boycott, Divestment, Sanctions (BDS) movement for Palestinian rights. SJP has a horizontal leadership structure where there are no officers, designated roles, or membership caps. Since the fall 2023 semester, we have held almost all event, media, and social media planning in conjunction with JVP because of our shared goals. SJP and JVP are both a part of Columbia University Apartheid Divest ("CUAD"), which is a coalition of student organizations that see Palestine as the vanguard for our collective liberation."

On April 20, 2024, NSJP put out a call to action for its local SJP chapters to encourage university students, staff, and faculty to "join the Popular University for Gaza." University encampments began in April 2024, and as of April 26, 2024, are active on at least 50 university campuses in the United States. Student activists at Columbia University drew national attention to the initiative on April 17, 2024, when they began their encampment. In fact, many other universities across the United States started their encampments in "solidarity" with the one at Columbia University.

There has been explicit support for violence at <u>Columbia University</u>, where on April 17, 2024, one protestor declared: "We are Hamas," while others chanted: "Al-Qassam [referring to the Izz ad-Din al-Qassam Brigades, Hamas's military wing] you make us proud, kill another soldier now!"⁸⁴ On April 18, a group of anti-Israel protestors reportedly threatened a group of Jewish students, saying, "Never forget the 7th of October... The 7th of October is about to be every f***ing day for you. You

84 Ibid.

⁷⁹ "Masar Badil: We call on all revolutionary forces and liberation movements to support the heroic Palestinian resistance," *Palestinian Alternative Revolutionary Path Movement*, October 7, 2023, https://masarbadil.org/en/2023/10/4361/

^{80 &}quot;Public DJHC Archive Document," *Documenting Jew Hatred on Campus*, V19, April 26, 2024, https://docs.google.com/document/d/li_gIbWQ7ZmpchHze7vKV52MfBCG0eHxLXGUgC1A34yQ/edit#heading=h.cwzg41tz6g70

^{81 &}quot;Affirmation of Maryam Alwan," New York County Clerk,
https://www.nyclu.org/sites/default/files/field_documents/nyscef_003_affirmation_of_maryam_alwan_2024-03-

^{82 @}nationalsjp, Instagram, April 22, 2024, https://www.instagram.com/nationalsjp/

^{83 &}quot;Campus Antisemitism Surges Amid Encampments and Related Protests at Columbia and Other U.S. Colleges," *ADL*, April 26, 2024, https://www.adl.org/resources/blog/campus-antisemitism-surges-amidencampments-and-related-protests-columbia-and-other

ready?"⁸⁵ Indeed, a significant portion of the rhetoric at the Columbia encampment has been inherently anti-American, anti-democratic, and anti-law enforcement.

In addition to explicit calls for violence and support for terrorism, the encampment at Columbia University has witnessed explicit antisemitic sentiment. In footage from the university, protestors could be heard calling Jewish students "Yehudim" (Hebrew for "Jews") and telling them, "Go back to Poland."⁸⁶

It was reported that in response to concerns for Jewish safety in April 2024, Rabbi Elie Buechler, a Rabbi associated with Columbia University's Orthodox Union Jewish Learning Initiative on Campus, "strongly" recommended a group of 300 Jewish students to return home from Columbia University.⁸⁷

A leader of the encampment protest, Khymani James, livestreamed a video where he argued that "Zionists don't deserve to live," and that he felt "very comfortable—very comfortable—calling for those people to die" (in reference to those who built the State of Israel). Sa James asked that viewers "Be glad, be grateful that I'm not just going out and murdering Zionists." When questioned about the language in the livestream, James was asked whether he saw why his statements were problematic, to which he responded "No," and went on to say that "taking someone's life in certain case scenarios is necessary and better for the overall world." In reference to his view on people who are Zionists, James stated that "some persons need to die." James had previously commented on social media that if he came into a fight with a Zionist, he would be fighting "to kill."

Despite claims from protestors that their encampments are solely peaceful—in spite of repeated calls for violence and Intifada—on April 30, 2024, protestors took over the Manhattan campus's Hamilton Hall, destroying university property (including breaking windows), hours after the university began suspending students who had

⁸⁵ Ibid.

^{86 &}quot;Campus Antisemitism Surges Amid Encampments and Related Protests at Columbia and Other U.S. Colleges," ADL, April 26, 2024, https://www.adl.org/resources/blog/campus-antisemitism-surges-amid-encampments-and-related-protests-columbia-and-other

⁸⁷ Celina Tebor, Zoe Sottile, and Matt Egan, "Columbia University faces full-blown crisis as rabbi calls for Jewish students to 'return home'," *CNN*, April 22, 2024, https://edition.cnn.com/2024/04/21/us/columbia-university-jewish-students-

 $[\]underline{protests/index.html\#:} \sim: text = \underline{Underscoring\%20concerns\%20about\%20student\%20safety, Orthodox\%20Jewish\%20students\%20\%E2\%80\%9Cstrongly\%E2\%80\%9D\%20recommending}$

^{88 &}quot;Columbia protest leader banned from campus for saying 'Zionists don't deserve to live'," *The Times of Israel*, April 27, 2024, https://www.timesofisrael.com/columbia-protest-leader-banned-from-campus-for-saying-zionists-dont-deserve-to-live/

⁸⁹ Ibid.

⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁹¹ Ibid.

⁹² Ibid.

defied the deadline to leave their encampment.⁹³ Police ultimately arrested 112 protestors at Columbia University, as police confirmed that 29 percent of those arrested were "not affiliated" with the institution.⁹⁴ Notably, this follows New York Mayor Eric Adam's comment that "outside agitators" have been involved in the student demonstrations.⁹⁵ NYPD deputy commissioner Kaz Daughtry further argued that "there is somebody funding this. There is somebody radicalizing our students."⁹⁶

There are <u>records of communication</u> from those within the encampment demonstrating anti-democratic and antisemitic rhetoric, indicative of the ideology of the Muslim Brotherhood and Hamas, in addition to incitement to violence. Furthermore, *Documenting Jew Hatred on Campus* compiled a concise <u>video</u> of some of the events described above at Columbia University.

⁹³ Isa Farfan, Doha Madani and Marlene Lenthang, "Protesters take over Columbia University building hours after school starts suspending student demonstrators," *NBC News*, April 30, 2024,

 $[\]underline{https://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/columbia-university-president-says-negotiations-protesters-stalled-sch-rcna149755}$

⁹⁴ Oliver Laughland, Gloria Oladipo, and Maya Yang, "NYPD issues arrest figures amid 'outside agitator' claim at Columbia Gaza protest," *The Guardian*, May 3, 2024, https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/article/2024/may/03/college-gaza-protests-nvu

⁹⁵ Ibid.

⁹⁶ Ibid.

The Middle East Institute (MEI) at Columbia University

The Middle East Institute (MEI) at Columbia University was founded in 1954, and states that it "promotes the interdisciplinary study of the Middle East and North Africa together with associated regions of Central Asia, South and Southeast Asia, Sub-Saharan Africa and related global communities." MEI collaborates closely with a wide range of institutions and organizations at Columbia and around the world. At Columbia University, its primary affiliates are:

- 1. **Center for the Study of Muslim Societies (CSMS):** CSMS "is an umbrella for faculty and student collaborations in cutting-edge research, integrated programming, innovative teaching and new forms of public outreach across the related fields of research on Islam and Muslim Societies at Columbia University."⁹⁸
- 2. **Center for Palestine Studies (CPS):** CPS "promotes the academic study of Palestine by supporting research, teaching, and intellectual collaboration among scholars within Columbia University and beyond. ... CPS also builds connections with other institutions and scholars to strengthen the academic study of Palestine and Palestinians throughout the United States and the world."⁹⁹

In practice, however, the MEI is a hub of vocal support for the BDS movement. Several of its staff members have voiced pro-Hamas sentiments following October 7, 2023. One example is Mohamed Abdou, who posted on Facebook days after the terrorist attack, on October 11, 2023, that he was "with the resistance be it Hamas and Hezbollah and Islamic Jihad." Abdou was hired by Columbia University on January 16 as the Arcapita Visiting Professor in Modern Arab Studies, despite the fact that a week before he reportedly proclaimed in a podcast interview that he was "with Hamas" and supports "the resistance, absolutely." In February 2024, Abdou was a speaker at a panel discussion hosted by Columbia School of International and Public Affairs (SIPA) titled "Propaganda and Genocide: Israel's War on the Truth." At the event, the sexual violence that occurred on October 7th was referred to as

^{97 &}quot;Middle East Institute," Middle East Institute, https://www.mei.columbia.edu/

^{98 &}quot;Center for the Study of Muslim Societies at Columbia University," *Columbia University*, https://csms.columbia.edu/

^{99 &}quot;Center for Palestine Studies," Columbia University, https://palestine.mei.columbia.edu/

¹⁰⁰ "Columbia hires, and claims to fire, professor who voiced support for Hamas post-Oct. 7," *The Times of Israel*, May 2, 2024, https://www.timesofisrael.com/columbia-hires-and-claims-to-fire-professor-who-voiced-support-for-hamas-post-oct-7/

¹⁰¹ Ibid.

"unsubstantial claims," and the Q&A began with the overtly antisemitic comment, "Who owns the media? Zionists!" Despite the university claiming to have terminated his contract, he appears to remain in his post at the time of writing. At the April 17 House Committee on Education and the Workforce hearing on Columbia University, Columbia President Minouche Shafik claimed that Abdou had been terminated, adding that, "He will never work at Columbia again." However, several repudiations, including from Abdou himself on April 27, 2024, suggest that Shafik's assertion was not correct. Abdou stated that, "I am not terminated. My contract is coming to an end on May 30." He claimed to be recording a video from his university office, and several witnesses have identified him on campus since Shafik's claim at the Congressional hearing. 106

On October 8, 2023, Columbia Professor Joseph Massad, who teaches modern Arab politics and intellectual history, described Hamas's terrorist attack on Israel as a "resistance offensive" to "Israeli settler-colonialism and racism toward the Palestinians." Within 24 hours of the October 7 pogrom, Massad penned an op ed on *The Electronic Intifada* referring to the terrorist attack as the "Palestinian war of liberation." Massad jubilantly referred to it as a "major achievement of the resistance in the temporary takeover of these settler-colonies." In response to such comments, a petition calling for the immediate removal of the tenured professor in the department of Middle Eastern, South Asian and African studies gained 47,000 signatures. As part of the mid-April hearing at Columbia, Shafik was questioned on the continued presence of Massad as the chair of the Academic Review Committee. While Shafik claimed that Massad "does not have a leadership role," Rep. Elise Stefanik pointed out that he was still listed as the chair of the committee on a Columbia website. In response, Shafik concluded that she "wasn't sure" on the matter. Is a January 2024 interview with *Al-Jazeera*, Massad

¹⁰³ **T1.** * .:

¹⁰⁴ "Columbia hires, and claims to fire, professor who voiced support for Hamas post-Oct. 7," *The Times of Israel*, May 2, 2024, https://www.timesofisrael.com/columbia-hires-and-claims-to-fire-professor-who-voiced-support-for-hamas-post-oct-7/

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid; @CampusJewHate, Twitter, May 7, 2024,

https://twitter.com/campusjewhate/status/1787892083530842136?s=48

¹⁰⁷ "Columbia University," *ADL*, https://www.adl.org/campus-antisemitism-report-card/columbia-university
¹⁰⁸ "Just another battle or the Palestinian war of liberation?" *Electronic Intifada*, October 8, 2023, https://electronicintifada.net/content/just-another-battle-or-palestinian-war-liberation/38661
¹⁰⁹ Ibid.

¹¹⁰ Noah Bernstein, "Petition calling for removal of MESAAS professor Joseph Massad garners over 47,000 signatures," *Columbia Spectator*, October 17, 2023,

 $[\]underline{https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/10/17/petition-calling-for-removal-of-mesaas-professor-joseph-massad-garners-over-47000-signatures/$

¹¹¹ Elisabeth Buchwald, "Professor who Columbia president said was 'spoken to' for calling Hamas invasion 'astounding' says he wasn't disciplined," *CNN*, April 18, 2024,

https://edition.cnn.com/2024/04/17/business/professor-columbia-president-hamas-attack/index.html ¹¹² Ibid.

declared that the United States "was - and still is – a settler colony, that sanctifies white supremacy over the rest of the people. Therefore, there is a kind of fusion between the U.S. and Israel. Israel reminds it of how things were in the United States in the past." In the same interview, he asserted that Israel is a "racist regime, which calls for the supremacy of the Jewish race." Massad has also appropriated the term "antisemitism" which historically refers to hatred and persecution of Jews. Instead, Massad reinterprets it to replace its meaning to refer to the murder of Arabs by Westerners and Israeli Jews. To demonstrate, in a 2004 op ed in Egypt's *Al-Ahram Weekly* newspaper, Massad asserted that Arabs and Muslims are in fact "the real victims of Western anti-Semitism." He further contended, "today we live in a world where anti-Arab and anti-Muslim hatred, derived from anti-Semitism, is everywhere in evidence. It is not Jews who are being murdered by the thousands by Arab anti- Semitism, but rather Arabs and Muslims who are being murdered by the tens of thousands by Euro-American Christian anti-Semitism and by Israeli Jewish antisemitism."

Another member of the MEI is Rashid Khalidi, the Edward Said Professor of Modern Arab Studies and author of *Palestinian Identity: The Construction of Modern National Consciousness* (1997) and *The Iron Cage: The Story of the Palestinian Struggle for Statehood* (2006), among others. During the 1982 Israel–Lebanon war, Khalidi was affiliated with the Palestinian Liberation Organization (PLO), the internationally recognized official representative of the Palestinian people. He halidi additionally advised the Palestinian delegation at the Madrid Conference of 1991, where he declared to the media that the delegation would be in "constant consultation" with the PLO, a blatant violation of the conference's ground rules. In fact, in a 1979 American radio documentary about the PLO, Khalidi was identified and interviewed as a spokesman for the group, then still an active terrorist organization. Khalidi has defended the recent "Gaza Solidarity Encampment" at Columbia University. He claimed that the protestors were being unjustly smeared by the media. He asserted that "there is nothing antisemitic about opposing a genocidal war, or in criticizing

¹¹³ "Columbia University Joseph Massad on Al- Jazeera TV: The US was, and is, a settler colonialist country; America supports Israel because of its colonialist past," *Middle East Media Research Institute*, January 26, 2024, https://www.memri.org/reports/columbia-university-professor-joseph-massad-al-jazeera-tv-us-was-and-still-settler

^{114 &}quot;Semites and antisemites, that is the question," *Al-Ahram Weekly* online, 9-15 December 2004.

¹¹⁶ Harry Lambert, "Rashid Khalidi: 'Israel is stealing land as we speak'," *The New Statesman*, November 13, 2023, https://www.newstatesman.com/international-content/the-international-interview/2023/11/rashid-khalidi-israel-palestine-war

¹¹⁷ Ibid; "Palestinian advisory committee keeps in contact with PLO," Jerusalem Post, October 30, 1991.

^{118 &}quot;The Gun and the Olive Branch," Radio documentary, *Pacifica Radio Archives* (1979), https://archive.org/details/Az0396TheGunAndTheOliveBrance-thePlo_434

Israeli apartheid."¹¹⁹ Khalidi went on to deny that the student protestors were responsible for manifestations of antisemitism on campus, despite specific public condemnations of antisemitism occurring there by the mayor of New York and the White House which denounced "calls for violence and physical intimidation targeting Jewish students."¹²⁰ On the morning following the arrest and shutdown of the Columbia encampment, Khalidi together with other faculty members gathered outside the university gates. He denounced the university administration's crackdown on the encampment and declared that they would "go down in infamy."¹²¹ More recently, at a retirement conference dedicated to Khalidi, some of the speakers noted that students who had studied under him were involved in the Gaza Columbia encampment and "drew a line between Khalidi's scholarship and the student protest movement."¹²²

Dr. Wael Hallaq, who is the Avalon Foundation Professor in the Humanities at Columbia University and is associated with the MEI, was invited to speak as part of a lecture series at the College of Islamic Studies (CIS) of Hamad Bin Khalifa University (HBKU) in February 2024. Research shows that Muslim Brotherhood ideology has a strong presence at HBKU and CIS, which are based in the Qatar Foundation's Education City in Doha. Several graduates of Columbia University now work at HBKU. For example, Dr. Recep Şentürk, the Dean of the College of Islamic Studies at HBKU, holds a PhD from Columbia University. Professor in the Humanities at HBKU, holds a PhD from Columbia University.

Mahmood Mamdani is the Herbert Lehman Professor of Government. In 2014, the Center for Palestine Studies at Columbia University held an informal debate on this question titled, "Palestine's South Africa Moment? The Boycott, Divest and Sanctions Movement." Mamdani was one of the speakers. During the program Mamdani called for the destruction of Israel. He asserted, "[T]he Palestinian challenge is to persuade the Jewish population of Israel and the world that, just as in

¹¹⁹ "Columbia professor says student protestors are being smeared," *Newsweek*, May 1, 2024, https://www.msn.com/en-us/news/world/columbia-professor-says-student-protesters-are-being-smeared/ar-AA1nRwrS

¹²⁰ Ibid; "Mayor Adams' statement on ongoing protests at Columbia University," *New York City Office of the Mayor*, April 21, 2024, https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/296-24/mayor-adams-on-ongoing-protests-columbia-university; "Columbia University: White House condemns antisemitism at college campuses," *BBC News*, April 22, 2024, https://www.aol.com/news/columbia-university-white-house-condemns-013330020.html
https://www.barrons.com/news/columbia-palestinian-expert-says-student-protesters-feel-moral-imperative-c43b7bf4

^{122 &}quot;Columbia Palestinian professor says student protestors feel 'moral imperative," *Agence France Presse*, May 8, 2024, https://www.msn.com/en-us/news/world/columbia-palestinian-expert-says-student-protesters-feel-moral-imperative/ar-BB1m2VUM

¹²³ "HBKU's CIS Hosts Public Lecture Series Featuring Dr. Wael Hallaq," *College of Islamic Studies, Hamad Bin Khalifa University*, February 18, 2024, https://www.hbku.edu.qa/en/news/what-is-sharia-lecture-series
¹²⁴ "Dr. Recep Şentürk," *Hamad Bin Khalifa University*, https://www.hbku.edu.qa/en/staff/dr-recep-senturk
¹²⁵ Mara Schiffren, "Dreaming of 'Palestine's South Africa Moment'," *Frontpage Mag*, December 22, 2014, https://www.frontpagemag.com/dreaming-palestines-south-africa-moment-mara-schiffren/">https://www.frontpagemag.com/dreaming-palestines-south-africa-moment-mara-schiffren/

South Africa, the long term security of a Jewish homeland requires the dismantling of the Jewish state."¹²⁶ In a 2015 article in the academic journal *Critical Inquiry* titled "Settler Colonialism: Then and Now," Mamdani rejected the comparison of Israel to apartheid South Africa, instead asserting what he terms "settler America" as a more fitting comparison. He asserted, "As in North America, the settler in Israel is not interested in Palestinians as a source of labor; he or she wants their land. Zionists in Israel have long drawn inspiration from how Americans cleansed the land of Indians."¹²⁷ During Columbia's Gaza Solidarity Encampment, Mamdani spoke "multiple times" to the protestors during the encampment and participated in a human barricade of some two dozen faculty members to protect the protestors. ¹²⁸

Numerous professors at Columbia are vocal supporters of the Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions (BDS) movement against Israel. Muhsin Jasim Al-Musawi is a literary critic and a scholar of classical and modern Arabic literature and comparative cultural studies. ¹²⁹ On December 20, 2012, Musawi signed a statement against UC Berkeley Chancellor Nicholas Dirks, a former vice president of Columbia's Faculty of Arts and Sciences, for raising questions about the BDS campaign at Columbia. ¹³⁰

In 2007, Columbia's Middle East Institute and School of International Affairs invited then Iranian president Mahmoud Ahmadinejad, infamous for his rabid antisemitism, to speak at the university. After Columbia's president Lee Bollinger condemned Ahmadinejad's antisemitism and Holocaust denial in his introduction at the event, professor of Anthropology and co-founder of the Center for Palestine Studies at Columbia University, Brinkley M. Messick signed on to a statement denouncing Bollinger's remarks for having "sullied the reputation of the University with its strident tone, and has abetted a climate in which incendiary speech prevails over open debate." Messick is a vocal supporter of the BDS movement, joining

¹²⁶ "Palestine's South Africa Moment? Part 2," Center for Palestine Studies, *YouTube*, March 6, 2015, https://www.voutube.com/watch?v=vStY24A89P0&t=382s

¹²⁷ Mamdani, Mahmood. "Settler Colonialism: Then and Now," *Critical Inquiry*, vol. 41, Spring 2015, https://misr.mak.ac.ug/sites/default/files/publications/Mamdani.pdf

¹²⁸ "Historic Gaza protests at Columbia University enter day 6; campus protests spread across country," *Democracy Now!* April 22, 2024, https://www.democracynow.org/2024/4/22/solidarity_encampment; April 29, 2024 Columbia begins suspending student protesters," *CNN*, April 30, 2024,

https://edition.cnn.com/business/live-news/university-protests-palestine-04-29-

^{24/}h_4be9167431ba3f2d54cdce4cdf911efd?ref=upstract.com

^{129 &}quot;Muhsin Jassim al-Musawi," *Middle East Institute*, Columbia University, https://www.mei.columbia.edu/faculty-mei/muhsin-jassim-al-musawi

¹³⁰ Wael Hallaq, "Letter to the editor: Former Vice-President Dirks defaming the department," *Columbia Spectator*, December 20, 2012, https://www.columbiaspectator.com/2012/12/19/letter-editor-former-vice-president-dirks-defaming-department/

¹³¹ "Columbia's Bollinger on Iran's Ahmadinejad," *National Public Radio*, September 26, 2007, https://www.npr.org/2007/09/26/14742209/columbias-bollinger-on-irans-ahmadinejad

¹³² "Columbia University Faculty Action Committee Statement of Concern," New York Sun, November 12, 2007.

numerous campaigns endorsing the movement, including a campaign that called for anthropologists to boycott Israeli academic institutions.¹³³

Gil Anidjar teaches in the Department of Religion and the Department of Middle Eastern, South Asian, and African Studies at Columbia University. ¹³⁴ On December 20, 2012 Anidjar signed a statement against UC Berkeley Chancellor Nicholas Dirks, a former vice president of Columbia's Faculty of Arts and Sciences, for raising questions about the BDS campaign at Columbia. ¹³⁵ In November 2002, Anidjar led an anti-Israel divestment conference at Columbia University entitled "National Day of Action Against Israeli Apartheid." ¹³⁶ The conference took place several weeks after a campaign was launched to pressure "Columbia to divest its funds from all firms that produce or sell arms or military hardware that is used by the state of Israel." ¹³⁷ In an interview discussing his book *The Jew, the Arab: A History of the Enemy*, Anidjar erased Jewish identity by claiming that Jews are neither a religion nor a race, asserting that the "last Semites and the only Semites become the Arabs." Andijar continued, "Better yet, the Arabs have become the race that is still attached to its religion, whereas the Jews have in fact become Western Christians, and therefore are no longer marked, neither by race nor by religion." ¹³⁸

Hamid Dabashi is the Hagop Kevorkian Professor of Iranian Studies and Comparative Literature at Columbia University. ¹³⁹ Dabashi is quoted as saying that, "There is a vulgarity of character [Israeli Jews] that is bone-deep and structural to the skeletal vertebrae of its culture." ¹⁴⁰ On February 2, 2017, Dabashi was named as an advisory board member of the US Campaign for the Academic and Cultural Boycott of Israel (USACBI), part of the BDS National Committee, tasked with overseeing the academic and cultural boycott aspects of BDS. ¹⁴¹ Dabashi has promoted an antisemitic trope demonizing Israel as a "key actor" in "every dirty

¹³³ "Anthropologists for the Boycott of Israeli Academic Institutions, 2014–2016 Campaign, October 2014, https://anthroboycott.wordpress.com/signatories/

^{134 &}quot;Gil Anidjar," Middle East Institute, https://www.mei.columbia.edu/faculty-mei/gil-anidjar

¹³⁵ Hallaq, "Letter to the editor: Former Vice-President Dirks defaming the department," *Columbia Spectator*, December 20, 2012, https://www.columbiaspectator.com/2012/12/19/letter-editor-former-vice-president-dirks-defaming-department/

¹³⁶ "Columbia University Divestment Campaign," Way Back Machine, https://web.archive.org/web/20021106195810/http://columbiadivest.org;80/index.html

¹³⁷ David Horowitz, *The Professors: The 101 Most Dangerous Academics in America* (United States: Regnery Publishing, 2006).

¹³⁸ "The Jew, the Arab: An Interview with Gil Anidjar," *Asia Society*, n.d., https://asiasociety.org/jew-arab-interview-gil-anidjar

^{139 &}quot;Hamid Dabashi," Middle East Institute, https://www.mei.columbia.edu/faculty-mei/hamid-dabashi

¹⁴⁰ Charles Jacobs Ralph A. Goldwasser, "Columbia Unbecoming—Then and Now," *The Forward*, December 27, 2016, https://forward.com/community/358502/columbia-unbecoming-then-and-now/

¹⁴¹ "Advisory Board," US Campaign for the Academic and Cultural Boycott of Israel, https://usacbi.org/advisory-board/

treacherous ugly and pernicious act happening in the world." Dabashi further blamed "diehard Fifth Column Zionists working against the best interests of Americans." Dabashi has compared Israel to the ISIS jihadist terrorist organization. In a 2019 Facebook post, Dabashi explained that the "murderous thugs" of ISIS "conquered parts of Syria and declared a 'caliphate.' He continued, "Their ISRAELI counterparts meanwhile conquered parts of Syria and declared it part of their Zionist settler colony." Concluding his argument Dabashi asserted, "The only difference: ISIS does not have a platoon of clean shaven and well coiffured [sic] columnists at the New York Times propagating the cause of the terrorist outfit as the Zionists columnists do on a regular basis." 144

¹⁴² Columbia University alums call for professor to be suspended over anti-Zionist posts," *The Times of Israel*, June 7, 2018, https://www.timesofisrael.com/columbia-u-alums-call-for-professor-to-be-suspended-over-anti-zionist-posts/

¹⁴³ Ibid.

¹⁴⁴ "Columbia University professor says Israel is almost identical to the Islamic State," *The Times of Israel*, April 5, 2019, https://www.timesofisrael.com/columbia-university-professor-says-israel-almost-identical-to-islamic-state

Analysis of Qatari Funding to Columbia University

Despite being legally required to do so, Columbia University has not reported any of the Qatari funding it has received to the US Department of Education's reporting system. Additionally, it makes no mention of any connections between Columbia University and Qatar or Qatari entities in its financial statements.

Activities	Estimated Funds in \$
Collaboration with Qatar Foundation International	500,000
NPRP Grants	1,500,000
Qatar & Columbia University Energy Partnerships	1,750,000
Qatar & Columbia University Education Partnerships	Unknown
Student Grants	3,420,000
Total	7,170,000

Figure 1: Qatar grants to Columbia University.

Qatar Foundation International at Columbia University

Qatar Foundation International LLC (QFI LLC), which was founded in 2012 in Delaware and is the U.S.-based subsidiary of the Qatar Foundation (QF), gives money to public schools to strengthen Arabic programs for children. ¹⁴⁵ QFI LLC has collaborated with Columbia University on numerous occasions, including:

- a. In March 2017, it was announced that QFI had launched a new partnership with Columbia University's Mailman School of Public Health, sponsoring a research project to assess the mental health and psychosocial needs of Arabic-speaking immigrant and refugee school children aged 13–17. The amount of the Qatari funding to this project was not disclosed.
- b. In April 25, 2018, the Qatari newspaper The Peninsula reported that,

"H H Sheikha Moza bint Nasser, Chairperson of Qatar Foundation for Education, Science and Community Development, launched yesterday a research project designed to study the mental health and psychosocial well-being of Arabic-speaking adolescent immigrants in the United States.

The study, which will be carried out by the Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health in partnership with Qatar

¹⁴⁵ Audrey Conklin, "Qatar Foundation International Funds Arabic Programs in Select US Schools," *Campus Watch*, August 15, 2019, https://www.meforum.org/campus-watch/59189/qatar-foundation-international-funds-arabic

¹⁴⁶ "QFI launches partnership with Columbia University," *Gulf Times*, November 5, 2017, https://www.gulf-times.com/story/569984/qfi-launches-partnership-with-columbia-university

Foundation International (QFI), a US-based member of QF, was launched yesterday at the University's campus in New York."¹⁴⁷

The research was conducted over 12 months, and the amount of Qatari funding to this project was not disclosed. ¹⁴⁸ Based on similar projects, ISGAP estimates that each project received funding in the amount of \$250,000.

Based on these calculations, ISGAP estimates that Columbia University received \$500,000 in Qatari funding (\$250,000 x 2 projects) through QFI LLC.



Figure 2: H H Sheikha Moza bint Nasser, Chairperson of Qatar Foundation for Education, Science and Community Development, with Dr Linda P Fried, Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health, during the New York launch of a research project conducted in partnership between the two organizations.¹⁴⁹

¹⁴⁷ "QFI, Columbia University launch research project," *The Peninsula*, April 25, 2018, https://thepeninsulaqatar.com/article/25/04/2018/QFI,-Columbia-University-launch-research-project

¹⁴⁸ "HH Sheikha Moza launches research partnership between Columbia University and Qatar Foundation International to study needs of Arab refugee students in US," *Moza bint Nasser*, April 24, 2018, https://www.mozabintnasser.qa/en/news/hh-sheikha-moza-launches-research-partnership-between-columbia-university-and-qatar-foundation

¹⁴⁹ "QFI, Columbia University launch research project," *The Peninsula*, April 25, 2018, <u>https://thepeninsulaqatar.com/article/25/04/2018/QFI,-Columbia-University-launch-research-project</u>

National Priorities Research Program (NPRP) Grants

The National Priorities Research Program (NPRP) is a key initiative of the Qatar National Research Fund (QNRF), which is part of the Qatar Foundation (QF). The NPRP aims to foster research culture in Qatar.

The following projects have been conducted in collaboration with Columbia University:

- a. NPRP 12S-0215-190090:¹⁵⁰ An integrated process for the simultaneous desalination of reject brine and CO₂ mineralization. Led by Qatar University, in collaboration with Columbia University and Qatar Shell Research & Technology Center.
- b. NPRP 12S-0131-190024:¹⁵¹ Hydrogen Production from Seawater Electrolysis using Highly Selective Earth-Abundant Catalysts and Membranelles Electrolyzer. Led by Texas A&M University at Qatar, in collaboration with Columbia University and Qatar Shell Research & Technology Center.
- c. NPRP 4-1058-168, 152 YSREP 1-018-1-004, 153 NPRP 09-1140-1-177, 154 and NPRP 08-485-1-083:155 Automatic Correction of Standard Arabic Text: Resource and System Development. Led by Carnegie Mellon University-Qatar, in collaboration with Columbia University.

In each of these projects, Columbia University is not the leading partner. However, ISGAP estimates that the Qatari contribution to Columbia University amounts to approximately \$250,000 per project.

Based on these calculations, ISGAP estimates that Columbia University received \$1,500,000 in Qatari funding (\$250,000 x 6 projects) through NPRP.

Qatar and Columbia University Energy Partnerships

Columbia University has extensive experience in the energy field, including a significant relationship with ExxonMobil, which donated to Columbia University for many years. 156 Since 1990, ExxonMobil has partnered with Qatar Petroleum on a

^{150 &}quot;Projects," QRDI Portal, https://connect.qrdi.org.qa/projects?page=1&query=NPRP12S-0215-190090&rnd=406

^{151 &}quot;Projects," *QRDI Portal*, https://connect.qrdi.org.qa/projects?page=1&query=NPRP12S-0215-190090&rnd=406

^{152 &}quot;Projects," *QRDI Portal*, https://connect.qrdi.org.qa/projects?page=1&query=NPRP%204-1058-168&rnd=574 "Projects," *QRDI Portal*, https://connect.qrdi.org.qa/projects?page=1&query=YSREP-1-018-1-004&rnd=223

^{154 &}quot;Projects," QRDI Portal, https://connect.grdi.org.qa/projects?page=1&query=NPRP-09-1140-1-177%20&rnd=334

^{155 &}quot;Projects," QRDI Portal, https://connect.qrdi.org.qa/projects?page=1&query=NPRP%2008-%20485-1-083%20%20&rnd=103

¹⁵⁶ Jesse Levine and Itzel Franco, "Columbia has received funding from fossil fuel companies for decades. That money keeps flowing," Columbia Daily Spectator, October 9, 2023, https://www.columbiaspectator.com/the-

major gas field in Qatar. ¹⁵⁷ Examples of partnerships between Columbia University and actors in the energy field include:

a. The Abdullah Bin Hamad Al-Attiyah International Foundation: "The Abdullah Bin Hamad Al-Attiyah International Foundation for Energy and Sustainable Development is a non-profit organization established to preserve and build upon H.E. Al-Attiyah's 40 years of service in the energy industry. His legacy includes important roles in a variety of senior leadership positions within the Government of Qatar and the international community on issues confronting humanity, including climate change and sustainable development."¹⁵⁸

The foundation describes Columbia University as a partner alongside QF and the Hamad Bin Khalifa University in Qatar. ¹⁵⁹

b. **Gas Processing Center (GPC):** Qatar University describes the Gas Processing Center (GPC) as follows: "Launched in 2007 by the College of Engineering at Qatar University, the Gas Processing Center (GPC) is committed to providing applied solutions to the challenges that face the oil and gas industry... The center works closely with universities worldwide in the field of oil and gas research such as Texas A&M Universities [*sic*], Columbia, Missouri for Science and Technology, Houston, Oklahoma (USA)."¹⁶⁰

Further evidence of the relationship between the GPC and Columbia University was disclosed on the GPC's LinkedIn page, which notes that a key system "was developed as an outcome of a QNRF funded project in collaboration with industrial partners and Columbia University in the USA." None of the Qatari grants for this research were reported to the DOE by Columbia University.

c. The following research was conducted by Qatar University, GPC staff members Muftah H. el Naas, a research professor, and Nafis Mahmud, a research assistant, along with Columbia University staff members Daniel V.

 $[\]underline{eye/2023/10/09/columbia-has-received-funding-from-fossil-fuel-companies-for-decades-that-money-keeps-flowing/}$

^{157 &}quot;About," ExxonMobil Qatar, https://www.exxonmobil.com.qa/en-qa

¹⁵⁸ "Background," The Abdullah Bin Hamad Al-Attiyah International Foundation for Energy and Sustainable Development, https://www.abhafoundation.org/aboutus_background

 $^{^{159}}$ "Members & Partners," The Abdullah Bin Hamad Al-Attiyah International Foundation for Energy and Sustainable Development, $\underline{\text{https://www.abhafoundation.org/members}}$

^{160 &}quot;Fact Book, 2021-22," Qatar University,

 $[\]frac{https://www.qu.edu.qa/static_file/qu/offices\%20and\%20departments/Chief\%20of\%20Strategy\%20and\%20Development/documents/Fact\%20Book\%202021-22\%20(EN).pdf$

¹⁶¹ Gas Processing Center, *LinkedIn*, https://www.linkedin.com/posts/gas-processing-center-b8387719a_the-gpc-welcomed-dr-seved-mosaveb-daryanavard-activity-7109898344411332609-uFeZ

Esposito, Kyle J.M. Bishop, Xueqi Pang, Dimitri Livitz, and Daniela V. Fraga Alvarez. 162 They are all connected to Columbia University's Department of Chemical Engineering.¹⁶³ Except for the first research project (NPRP 12S-0215-190090) in the following list, there is no evidence of this connection on the portal of the Qatar Research and Development Innovation Council (QRDI), the hub that funds research in Qatar.

- 1. Evaluation of parameters controlling calcium recovery and CO₂ uptake from desalination reject brine: An optimization approach (NPRP 12S-0215-190090),164 2022.165
- 2. Alkalinity Enhancement during Reject Brine Electrolysis: Role of Electrocatalyst Placement on the Outer Surfaces of Porous Flowthrough Electrodes, 2023.166
- 3. Design Rules for Porous Flow-through Electrodes Used in Membrane-Free Electrolyzers for Treatment of Desalination Reject Brine, 2022. 167
- 4. Magnesium recovery from desalination reject brine as pretreatment for membraneless electrolysis, 2022.¹⁶⁸
- 5. Condensed Layer Deposition of Nanoscopic TiO2 Overlayers on High Surface Area Electrocatalysts, 2023. 169
- 6. Scalable Membrane-Free Electrolyzers for Electrochemical CO₂ Conversion, 2023. 170
- 7. Condensed Layer Deposition of Nanoscopic TiO₂ Overlayers on High Surface Area Electrocatalysts, 2023.¹⁷¹

In each of these projects, Columbia University is not the leading partner. ISGAP estimates that each project has a budget of over \$1 million and that the Qatari

^{162 &}quot;People," Gas Processing Center, Qatar University,

https://gpc.qu.edu.ga/sites/en_US/research/gpc/about/people

¹⁶³ Daniela V. Fraga Alvarez et al., "Alkalinity Enhancement during Reject Brine Electrolysis: Role of Electrocatalyst Placement on the Outer Surfaces of Porous Flow-Through Electrodes," ACS Sustainable Chemistry & Engineering (2013,) https://pubs.acs.org/doi/pdf/10.1021/acssuschemeng.3c04288

^{164 &}quot;Muftah El-Naas," *ORCID*, https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6164-1421
165 Nafis Mahmud, "Evaluation of parameters controlling calcium recovery and CO₂ uptake from desalination reject brine: An optimization approach," *Journal of Cleaner Production, Qatar University* (2022) https://qspace.qu.edu.qa/handle/10576/34652?show=full

^{166 &}quot;Muftah El-Naas," ORCID, https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6164-1421

¹⁶⁷ Daniel Esposito et al., "Design Rules for Porous Flow-through Electrodes Used in Membrane-Free Electrolyzers for Treatment of Desalination Reject Brine," The Electrochemical Society (2022), https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1149/MA2022-02271063mtgabs/meta

^{168 &}quot;Nafis Mahmud," ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Nafis-Mahmud
169 "Nafis Mahmud," ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Nafis-Mahmud

¹⁷⁰ "Xueqi Pang," ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/search?q=Xueqi+Pang

¹⁷¹ Daniela V. Fraga Alvarez et al., "Condensed Layer Deposition of Nanoscopic TiO₂ Overlayers on High Surface Area Electrocatalysts," ResearchGate (2023)

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/376336777_Condensed_Layer_Deposition_of_Nanoscopic_TiO2_Over layers_on_High_Surface_Area_Electrocatalysts

contribution to Columbia University amounts to approximately \$250,000 per project.

Based on these calculations, ISGAP estimates that Columbia University received \$1,750,000 in Qatari funding (\$250,000 x 7 research projects) through Qatar and Columbia University Energy Partnerships.

Qatar and Columbia University Education Partnerships

In the cases listed below, Columbia University has not disclosed any information regarding Qatari funding in its financial statements or through the DOE's reporting system. Therefore, ISGAP is unable to estimate the funding received in the framework of these partnerships. ISGAP calls on Columbia University to make this information publicly available. It can be assumed that these conferences were usually fully funded by Qatar, including coverage of lecturers' and participants' expenses.

- a. In April 2014, QF hosted a delegation from Columbia University for "an overview of the unique architecture and interior design within Education City in Qatar."¹⁷²
- b. On September 20, 2019, the World Innovation Summit for Education (WISE) held an international conference on the future of AI in education, alongside UNESCO and Teachers College, Columbia University. Six of the panelists and speakers were Columbia University staff, headed by Thomas Bailey, President, Paulo Blikstein, Associate Professor of Communications, Media, and Learning Technology Design, Stephanie J. Rowley Provost, Dean, and Vice President of Academic Affairs, Sandra Okita, Associate Professor of Technology and Education, and Hod Lipson, James and Sally Scapa Professor of Innovation. The conference took place at Teachers College, Columbia University. The relationship with Teachers College is significant as a result of the unique role of the institution in its purpose of training the educators of future generations. Notably, their Institutional Review Board (IRB) Chair, Professor Karen Froud, has called to boycott Israeli academia. Furthermore,

¹⁷² "Columbia University team gains insight into Education City," *Gulf Times*, April 21, 2014, https://www.gulf-times.com/story/389270/columbia-university-team-gains-insight-into-education-city

¹⁷³ "The Future of AI in education," *WISE*, Qatar Foundation, https://www.wise-qatar.org/future-artificial-intelligence-education-teachers-college-columbia-university/
¹⁷⁴ Ibid.

¹⁷⁵ "Where Does Artificial Intelligence Fit in the Classroom?," *Web Archive*, https://web.archive.org/web/20200815110707/https://www.tc.columbia.edu/aiconference/

¹⁷⁶ "The Latest Academic Boycott Attempts," *Israel Academia Monitor*, 10 March 2022, https://israel-academia-monitor.com/2022/03/10/the-latest-academic-boycott-attempts/; "Leadership - 2023 – 2024," *Office of the Provost, Teachers College, Columbia University*, https://www.tc.columbia.edu/provost/faculty-staff-resources/faculty-resources/department-leadership-and-college-committees/

faculty of the Teachers College have not only supported the Columbia encampments, but actually took part in them. Indeed, faculty conducted classes, office hours and meetings from within the encampment.¹⁷⁷ On the Instagram account, Teachers College Abolition Collective, multiple photos emerged of Dr. Sandra Schmidt, the Program Director for social studies education, holding a class within the encampment.¹⁷⁸

- c. On November 18, 2023, it was announced that the 11th edition of the WISE Summit would be held at the Qatar National Convention Centre (QNCC) on 28–29 November. Attendees were to include Jeffrey Sachs, Professor and Director of the Center for Sustainable Development at Columbia University.¹⁷⁹
- d. The Educate A Child program (EAC) of Education Above All (EAA), established by Sheikha Moza bint Nasser, hosted a panel discussion on 5–9 March, 2017, in Atlanta, Georgia. This conference convened an impressive cadre of education stakeholders, including Open Society Foundations, UNESCO, the U.S. Fund for UNICEF, the Results for Development Institute, Columbia University's Teachers College and Education Above All/Educate A Child. 180

Student Grants

The Amiri Scholarship Program

The Amiri Scholarship Program, which is fully funded by the State of Qatar, is designed to sponsor university students for full-time undergraduate and graduate studies abroad at leading international universities. The program offers comprehensive support, including coverage for tuition, mandatory fees, monthly living stipends, books, medical insurance, and more.

Partnering with 35 elite institutions across six countries, the program facilitates educational opportunities for Qatari students. These partner countries include the United States (21 institutions), the United Kingdom (five institutions), Canada (two institutions), Australia (one institution), Japan (one institution), and Qatar itself

¹⁷⁷ Hannah Sarisohn, "Thousands at Columbia sign letter calling for enforcement of school policy," *The Jerusalem Post*, April 25, 2024, https://www.jpost.com/diaspora/antisemitism/article-798745

¹⁷⁸ Ibid; @tcabolition, Instagram, https://www.instagram.com/tcabolition/

 ^{179 &}quot;Qatar Foundation's WISE announces key speakers and program for upcoming 11th edition of global summit," Zawya, November 18, 2023, https://www.educations-wise-announces-key-speakers-and-program-for-upcoming-11th-edition-of-global-summit-gi5rvljy
 180 "EAC attends the CIES Conference on 'Problematizing (in) Equality," Education Above All Foundation, April 10, 2017, https://www.educationaboveall.org/media-centre/news/eac-attends-cies-conference-problematizing-equality

(five institutions).¹⁸¹ As the table below demonstrates, Columbia University is one of the partners of the Amiri Scholarship Program.

الدولة	اسم الجامعة	#
US	Brown University	1
US	California Institute of Technology	2
US	Columbia University	3
US	Cornell University	4
US	Dartmouth University	5
US	Duke University	6
US	Georgetown University	7
US	Harvard University	8
UK	Imperial College London	9
US	Johns Hopkins University	10
UK	King's College London	11
US	Massachusetts Institute of Technology	12
Canada	McGill University	13
US	New York University	14
US	Northwestern University	15
US	Princeton University	16
US	Rice University	17
US	Stanford University	18
UK	University College London	19
Canada	University of British Columbia	20
US	University of California, Berkeley	21
US	University of California, Los Angeles	22
UK	University of Cambridge	23
US	University of Chicago	24
Australia	University of Melbourne	25
US	University of Michigan-Ann Arbor	26
UK	University of Oxford	27
US	University of Pennsylvania	28
Japan	University of Tokyo	29
US	Yale University	30
Qatar	Weill Cornell (Medicine-Qatar)	31
Qatar	Georgetown University - Qatar	32
Qatar	Northwestern University- Qatar	33
Qatar	Carnegie Mellon University- Qatar	34
Qatar	Texas A & M University - Qatar	35

Figure 3: List of universities included in the Amiri Scholarship Program. 182

¹⁸¹ "Cornell University, Universities and Colleges," *Scribd*, https://www.scribd.com/document/685344877/%D9%82%D8%A7%D8%A6%D9%85%D8%A9-

https://www.scribd.com/document/685344877/%D9%82%D8%A7%D8%A6%D9%85%D8%A9-

[%]D8%AC%D8%A7%D9%85%D8%B9%D8%A7%D8%AA-%D8%A8%D8%B1%D9%86%D8%A7%D9%85%D8%AC-

[%]D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A8%D8%B9%D8%AB%D8%A9-

[%]D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%8A%D8%B1%D9%8A%D8%A9-

[%]D8%AD%D8%AF%D9%8A%D8%AB%D8%A9

 $^{^{182}}$ "Cornell University, Universities and Colleges," Scribd,

According to the Columbia University website, total tuition rates for the 2023–2024 academic year amount to nearly \$90,000. 183

Through a cursory examination of the educational backgrounds of Qatari individuals, ISGAP found that 14 Qataris obtained degrees from Columbia University between 2006 and 2023. Collectively, these individuals have amassed a total of 38 years of study at Columbia University.¹⁸⁴

Based on these calculations, ISGAP estimates that Columbia University received \$3,420,000 in Qatari funding (38 years of study x \$90,000 tuition) through the Amiri Scholarship Program.

 $[\]frac{\%D8\%AC\%D8\%A7\%D9\%85\%D8\%B9\%D8\%A7\%D8\%AA-\%D8\%A8\%D8\%B1\%D9\%86\%D8\%A7\%D9\%85\%D8\%AC-\%D8\%A7\%D9\%84\%D8\%A8\%D8\%B9\%D8\%AB\%D8\%A9-$

[%]D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%8A%D8%B1%D9%8A%D8%A9-

[%]D8%AD%D8%AF%D9%8A%D8%AB%D8%A9

¹⁸³ "College Partners, Columbia University, Financial Aid," *QuestBridge*, https://www.questbridge.org/college-partners/columbia-university/financial_aid

¹⁸⁴ https://isgap.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/05/Oatar_Profiles.pdf

Policy Recommendations

- 1. Columbia University must report all previous and ongoing foreign funding (especially from Qatar and other nations which are anti-democratic) to the U.S. Department of Education (DOE).
- 2. Prohibit any further direct Qatari government funding to U.S. universities operating in Qatar or in the United States. Require full disclosure under the Foreign Agents Registration Act of any Qatar-linked funds already received by U.S. universities.
- 3. Open a federal government investigation into non-reporting of any and all foreign donations to U.S. universities. Take criminal action against systematic underreporting by U.S. universities and individuals of financial donations received directly or indirectly from Qatar. The investigation should explore the impact of Qatari funding on the increase of antisemitism, anti-Western and anti-democratic rhetoric in higher education.
- 4. Universities should ban all on-campus activities of NSJP/SJP (and their allies) until a formal review is carried out and the DOE issues guidelines on how these organizations should be viewed. NSJP has explicitly called for violence and has declared itself to be part of a movement led by a terrorist organization. Additionally, a federal government investigation should be conducted into the "outside agitators" who are reportedly infiltrating and radicalizing student protestors.
- 5. Add a provision to Section 117 of the Higher Education Act 1965 that mandates the disclosure of grantees who maintain any significant connection to the state of Qatar directly or indirectly.
- 6. Investigate and prosecute any undisclosed Qatari and foreign funding (especially from anti-democratic and anti-Western nations) of U.S. university programs or personnel as illegal, unregistered foreign lobbying. Shut down programs funded through such illicit means.
- 7. Establish ethics review boards at U.S. universities to monitor all foreign funding sources and block unacceptable or partnerships which compromise academic integrity.
- 8. Enact further transparency laws requiring full public disclosure of any foreign contracts, grants, or donations received by U.S. universities, including itemized reporting on collaborative projects, travel sponsorship, endowed faculty chairs, and other benefits.